

# Boston College Law Review

---

Volume 59

Issue 9 *Annual Survey of Federal En Banc and Other  
Significant Cases*

Article 29

---

5-24-2018

## Front Matter

Boston College Law Review  
*Boston College Law School*

Follow this and additional works at: <http://lawdigitalcommons.bc.edu/bclr>

---

### Recommended Citation

Boston College Law Review, *Front Matter*, 59 B.C.L. Rev. E. Supp. (2018), <http://lawdigitalcommons.bc.edu/bclr/vol59/iss9/29>

This Front Matter is brought to you for free and open access by the Law Journals at Digital Commons @ Boston College Law School. It has been accepted for inclusion in Boston College Law Review by an authorized editor of Digital Commons @ Boston College Law School. For more information, please contact [nick.szydowski@bc.edu](mailto:nick.szydowski@bc.edu).

# BOSTON COLLEGE LAW REVIEW

Volume 59

2018

E. Supp.

## COMMENTS

### ANNUAL SURVEY OF FEDERAL EN BANC AND OTHER SIGNIFICANT CASES

EXCESSIVE FORCE, POLICE DOGS, AND THE FOURTH AMENDMENT IN THE NINTH CIRCUIT: THE USE OF SUMMARY JUDGEMENT IN <i>LOWRY V. CITY OF SAN DIEGO</i> <i>Natasha Dobrott</i> .....	1
THE DEPARTMENT THAT CRIED WOLF: TENTH CIRCUIT VACATES PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION IN ABSENCE OF LIKELY INJURY IN <i>NEW MEXICO DEPARTMENT OF GAME &amp; FISH V. UNITED STATES</i> <i>DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR</i> <i>Curtis Cranston</i> .....	23
IF TECHNOLOGY IS THE HARE, IS CONGRESS THE TORTOISE? SPLIT CIRCUITS IN THE WAKE OF <i>DAHDA</i> <i>Michael Koch</i> .....	45
TITLE VII IS NOT THE ONLY CURE FOR EMPLOYMENT DISCRIMINATION: THE IMPLICATIONS OF <i>DOE V. MERCY</i> <i>CATHOLIC MEDICAL CENTER</i> IN EXPANDING CLAIMS FOR MEDICAL RESIDENTS UNDER TITLE IX <i>Amy-Lee Goodman</i> .....	64
<i>MAYHEW V. TOWN OF SMYRNA</i> : THE SIXTH CIRCUIT FRUSTRATES PUBLIC EMPLOYEES' RIGHT TO A JURY TRIAL <i>Margaux Joselow</i> .....	83
PRAYING FOR CLARITY: <i>LUND, BORMUTH</i> , AND THE SPLIT OVER LEGISLATOR-LED PRAYER <i>John Gavin</i> .....	104
BANKRUPTCY'S EXCEPTIONS TO DISCHARGE: WHEN DOES A STATEMENT ABOUT A SINGLE ASSET RESPECT THE DEBTOR'S FINANCIAL CONDITION? <i>Roman Ibragimov</i> .....	119
NO PUBLIC BENEFITS FOR <i>PUBLIC BENEFIT</i> : THE ELEVENTH CIRCUIT'S NARROW APPROACH TO COPYRIGHT REGISTRATION <i>Emily Tate</i> .....	134

YOU MIGHT JUST HAVE TO WAIT: INTERPRETING STATE ACTION IMMUNITY AND THE ABILITY TO APPEAL FOLLOWING THE NINTH CIRCUIT’S DECISION IN <i>SOLARCITY CORP. V. SALT RIVER PROJECT</i> <i>Hunter Malasky</i> .....	149
CIRCUMVENTING CONGRESS’S COMPREHENSIVE SCHEMES: THE THIRD CIRCUIT ALLOWS EMPLOYEES OF EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS TO BYPASS TITLE VII AND BRING CLAIMS UNDER TITLE IX IN <i>DOE V. MERCY CATHOLIC MEDICAL CENTER</i> <i>Lauren Stewart</i> .....	168
<i>TURNER</i> -ING OVER A NEW LEAF: PRE-CHARGE PLEA NEGOTIATIONS AS A CRITICAL STAGE FOR THE PURPOSES OF THE SIXTH AMENDMENT RIGHT TO COUNSEL <i>Alexis Berglund</i> .....	188
“BEARS NEED ROOM TO ROAM”: THE NINTH CIRCUIT’S QUESTIONABLE INTERPRETATION OF CRITICAL HABITAT DESIGNATION <i>Katherine Lee</i> .....	206
PRIVACY, SCREENED OUT: ANALYZING THE THREAT TO INDIVIDUAL PRIVACY RIGHTS AND FIFTH AMENDMENT PROTECTIONS IN <i>STATE V. STAHL</i> <i>Jesse Coulon</i> .....	225
LEGAL LIMBO: THE FIFTH CIRCUIT’S DECISION IN <i>TURNER V.</i> <i>DRIVER</i> FAILS TO CLARIFY THE CONTOURS OF THE PUBLIC’S FIRST AMENDMENT RIGHT TO RECORD THE POLICE <i>Stephanie Johnson</i> .....	245
TITLE VII AND THE COLLATERAL SOURCE RULE: EVALUATING THE NOT-SO EQUITABLE REMEDY IN <i>EEOC V. CONSOL ENERGY</i> <i>Virginia Calistro</i> .....	263
<i>PUBLIC ENTITIES BECOME A MODEL AGAINST AGE DISCRIMINATION:</i> <i>EXPANDING THE DEFINITION OF “EMPLOYER” IN GUIDO V.</i> <i>MOUNT LEMMON FIRE DISTRICT</i> <i>Kathryn Weston</i> .....	279
CEMENTING GOOD LAW BY TOLERATING BAD OUTCOMES: EXAMINING THE EIGHTH CIRCUIT’S COMMITMENT TO UPHOLDING THE DEFENSE OF QUALIFIED IMMUNITY FOR PRISON OFFICIALS IN <i>KULKAY V. ROY</i> <i>Peter Diliberti</i> .....	297

MUDDYING THE CHEVRON WATERS: THE D.C. CIRCUIT LACKS DOCTRINAL CLARITY IN <i>WATERKEEPER ALLIANCE V. EPA</i> <i>Christopher Crocker</i> .....	314
LAWFUL PERMANENT RESIDENCY: WHAT THE UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP & IMMIGRATION SERVICES GIVETH, IT CAN ALSO TAKE AWAY <i>Rebecca Hayes</i> .....	329
INCAPACITATING DANGEROUS REPEAT OFFENDERS (OR NOT): EVIDENTIARY RESTRICTIONS ON ARMED CAREER CRIMINAL ACT SENTENCING IN <i>UNITED STATES V. KING</i> <i>Kayleigh E. McGlynn</i> .....	348
THE ROAD BEYOND <i>KIOBEL</i> : THE FIFTH CIRCUIT’S DECISION IN <i>ADHIKARI V. KELLOGG BROWN &amp; ROOT, INC.</i> AND ITS IMPLICATIONS FOR THE ALIEN TORT STATUTE <i>Vasundhara Prasad</i> .....	369
UNFAITHFUL BUT NOT WITHOUT PRIVACY PROTECTIONS: THE SEVENTH CIRCUIT ADDRESSES WHEN COURTS SHOULD CONSIDER AN E-MAIL INTERCEPTION UNLAWFUL IN <i>EPSTEIN V.</i> <i>EPSTIEN</i> <i>Joseph Noreña</i> .....	391
ADDING TO THE LIST: THE LATEST DEVELOPMENT IN THE ANOMALOUS SEVENTH CIRCUIT SUBSTANTIAL COMPLIANCE APPROACH <i>Julian Viksman</i> .....	409
HOME SWEET HOME? DETERMINING HABITUAL RESIDENCE WITHIN THE MEANING OF THE HAGUE CONVENTION <i>Morgan McDonald</i> .....	427
A CASE FOR REVISITING THE CHILD WELFARE ACT <i>Hannah Dudley</i> .....	444
NO HARM, NO FOUL: THE FOURTH CIRCUIT STRUGGLES WITH THE “INJURY-IN-FACT” REQUIREMENT TO ARTICLE III STANDING IN DATA BREACH CLASS ACTIONS <i>Brandon Ferrick</i> .....	462
THE EXIGENCIES OF DRUNK DRIVING: <i>CRIPPS V. STATE</i> AND THE ISSUES WITH TAKING DRIVERS’ BLOOD WITHOUT A WARRANT <i>Timothy Andrea</i> .....	482

STRIVING FOR CONSISTENCY: THE BATTLE OF JURISDICTION IN ENFORCING ARBITRATION AWARDS <i>Leah Hengemuhle</i> .....	499
WHEN THE DEFENDANT DOESN'T TESTIFY: THE EIGHTH CIRCUIT CONSIDERS A REASONABLE BROKEN PROMISE IN <i>BAHTOUH V.</i> <i>SMITH</i> <i>Alexandre Bou-Rhodes</i> .....	520
A PRO DEBTOR AND MAJORITY APPROACH TO THE “AUTOMATIC STAY” PROVISION OF THE BANKRUPTCY CODE— <i>IN RE COWEN</i> INCORRECTLY DECIDED <i>Claudia A. Restrepo</i> .....	537
ELEVENTH CIRCUIT PREMATURELY APPLIED THE RULE OF LENITY IN <i>UNITED STATES V. IZURIETA</i> <i>C. Alex Dilley</i> .....	554

---

Boston College Law School publishes the *Boston College Law Review* (ISSN 0161-6587) eight times per year: in January, February, March, April, May, June, October, and November. In addition, the *Review* publishes an electronic supplement, the *E. Supp.*, once per year. Editorial and Business Offices: Boston College Law Review, 885 Centre Street, Newton Centre, Massachusetts 02459. Telephone: (617) 552-8557; email: [bclr@bc.edu](mailto:bclr@bc.edu). Periodical-class postage paid at Boston, Massachusetts and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to Boston College Law Review, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331.

Current subscription: \$70.00; single issues: \$10.00 (plus \$10.00 for foreign mailing for both).

Print issues from the current and previous years' volumes are available upon request. Back issues of volumes 1–53 may be obtained from William S. Hein & Co., Inc. Warehouse, 24 East Ferry St., Buffalo, New York 14209–1987, (716) 882–2600. (Back issues in electronic format are available at HeinOnline <http://heinonline.org/>). Please direct requests for issues from volume 54 onward to Sheridan Press, 450 Fame Avenue, Hanover, PA 17331, (717) 632–3535.

Address changes should be sent at least 45 days before the date of the issue with which it is to take effect. The post office will not forward copies unless subscribers provide extra postage. **Claims for missing issues will be honored for one year from the date of publication only.** Direct subscription queries, claims, and address changes to:

Boston College Law Review  
P.O. Box 465  
Hanover, PA 17331  
(717) 632–3535 (ask for Subscriber Services)  
Fax: (717) 633–8920  
Email: [pubsvc.tsp@sheridan.com](mailto:pubsvc.tsp@sheridan.com)

# BOSTON COLLEGE LAW SCHOOL

## ADMINISTRATION

WILLIAM P. LEAHY, S.J., B.A., M.A., M.Div., S.T.L., Ph.D., President  
MICHAEL J. LOCHHEAD, B.S., M.B.A., Executive Vice President  
DAVID QUIGLEY, M.A., Ph.D., Provost, Dean of Faculties  
VINCENT D. ROUGEAU, A.B., J.D., Dean  
ALFRED C. YEN, B.S., M.S., J.D., Associate Dean for Faculty  
MARIS ABBENE, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Academic, Career & Student Services  
FILIPPA MARULLO ANZALONE, A.B., M.S.L.S., J.D., Associate Dean for Library & Computing Services  
BRIAN J.M. QUINN, B.S.F.S., M.P.P., J.D., M.L.S., Associate Dean of Experiential Learning  
JOHN P. STACHNIEWICZ, A.B., M.A., Associate Dean for Finance & Administration  
MEREDITH RYAN, B.A., Assistant Dean for Finance & Administration  
JESSICA CASHDAN, B.A., M.A., Executive Director of Advancement & Associate Dean  
TRACEY WEST, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean for External Relations, Diversity & Inclusion  
SHAWN McSHAY, B.A., Assistant Dean for Admissions & Financial Aid  
HEATHER HAYES, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Career Services  
JOHN A. GORDON, B.S., J.D., Director of Law Review Publications  
FREDERICK M. ENMAN, S.J., B.A., J.D., Special Assistant to the Dean for Students

## FULL-TIME FACULTY

ALEXIS ANDERSON, B.A., M.A., J.D., Associate Clinical Professor of Law  
FILIPPA MARULLO ANZALONE, A.B., M.S.L.S., J.D., Professor of Law  
PAULO BARROZO, LL.B., M.Jur., Ph.D., LL.M., S.J.D., Associate Professor of Law  
SHARON BECKMAN, A.B., J.D., Associate Clinical Professor of Law  
MARY SARAH BILDER, B.A., A.M., J.D., Ph.D., Founders Professor of Law  
ROBERT M. BLOOM, B.S., J.D., Professor of Law  
E. JOAN BLUM, A.B., J.D., Associate Professor of Legal Reasoning, Research & Writing  
CHERYL S. BLATT, B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Legal Reasoning, Research & Writing  
MARK S. BRODIN, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law  
GEORGE D. BROWN, A.B., J.D., Robert Drinan, S.J. Professor of Law  
R. MICHAEL CASSIDY, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law  
MARY ANN CHIRBA, B.A., M.P.H., Sc.D., J.D., Professor of Legal Reasoning, Research & Writing  
JEFFREY M. COHEN, B.A., M.St., J.D., Assistant Professor of Legal Reasoning, Research & Writing  
DANIEL R. COQUILLETTE, A.B., B.A., M.A., J.D., J. Donald Monan, S.J. Professor of Law  
DAVID FARBMAN, A.B., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law  
SCOTT T. FITZGIBBON, B.A., J.D., B.C.L., Professor of Law  
FRANK J. GARCIA, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law  
KENT GREENFIELD, A.B., J.D., Professor of Law  
DEAN M. HASHIMOTO, A.B., M.S., M.P.H., M.D., J.D., Associate Professor of Law  
FRANK R. HERRMANN, S.J., A.B., M.Div., J.D., Associate Professor of Law  
INGRID M. HILLINGER, A.B., J.D., Professor of Law  
MARY HOLPER, B.A., J.D., Associate Clinical Professor; Director, Immigration Clinic  
KARI E. HONG, A.B., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law  
RENEE M. JONES, A.B., J.D., Professor of Law  
DANIEL KANSTROOM, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law  
M. CATHLEEN KAVENY, A.B., M.A., J.D., P.Phil., Ph.D., Darald & Juliet Libby Professor of Law  
ELISABETH KELLER, B.A., M.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Legal Reasoning, Research & Writing  
THOMAS C. KOHLER, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law  
JOSEPH P. LIU, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law  
DANIEL LYONS, A.B., J.D., Associate Professor of Law  
RAY D. MADOFF, A.B., J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law  
PATRICIA A. McCOY, B.A., J.D., Liberty Mutual Insurance Professor of Law  
JUDITH A. McMORROW, B.A./B.S., J.D., Professor of Law  
ALAN D. MINUSKIN, B.A., J.D., Associate Clinical Professor of Law  
SHU-YI OEI, A.B., M.T.S., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law  
DAVID OLSON, B.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law  
LYNNISE E. PANTIN, B.A., J.D., Associate Clinical Professor of Law  
VLAD PERJU, LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D., Associate Professor of Law  
ZYGUMUNT J.B. PLATER, B.A., J.D., LL.M., S.J.D., Professor of Law  
BRIAN J.M. QUINN, B.S.F.S., M.P.P., J.D., M.L.S., Associate Professor of Law  
JAMES R. REPETTI, A.B., M.B.A., J.D., William J. Kenealy, S.J. Professor of Law  
DIANE RING, A.B., J.D., Professor of Law  
VINCENT D. ROUGEAU, A.B., J.D., Dean & Professor of Law  
EVANGELINE SARDA, B.A., J.D., Associate Clinical Professor of Law  
FRANCINE SHERMAN, B.A., J.D., Associate Clinical Professor, Director, Juvenile Rights Advocacy Project  
NATALYA SHNITSER, B.A., M.A., J.D., David & Pamela Donohue Assistant Professor of Law  
MARK SPIEGEL, A.B., J.D., Professor of Law  
PAUL R. TREMBLAY, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law  
MAUREEN VAN NESTE, A.B., M.P.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Legal Reasoning, Research & Writing  
CATHARINE WELLS, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., Professor of Law  
RYAN WILLIAMS, B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law  
DAVID A. WIRTH, A.B., A.M., J.D., Professor of Law  
ALFRED C. YEN, B.S., M.S., J.D., Professor of Law  
KATHARINE G. YOUNG, B.A., LL.B., S.J.D., LL.M., Associate Professor of Law

# BOSTON COLLEGE LAW REVIEW

---

---

Volume 59

January 2018

Number 1

---

---

Kelsey Gasseling  
Caitlin J. Toto  
*Editors in Chief*

Nicholas Baker  
Maria Benvenuto  
Michael O'Loughlin  
Daniel Sorger  
*Executive Articles Editors*

Chloe Booth  
Christopher Cataldo  
Christina Lam  
Jordan Lamson  
*Executive Notes Editors*

Matthew Rapkowski  
*Online Editor*

*Articles Editors*

Daniel Cahill  
Thomas Carlton  
Brandon Curtin  
Samantha Cutler  
Sean Kennedy  
Luis Alex Galliani  
Paul Lakkis

Franklin Liu  
David Mahoney  
Jonathan Mangel  
Terence McAllister  
Kelly Morgan  
Anna Nikolayeva  
Matthew Rapkowski

Venus Chui  
Antonio G. Fraone  
Taylor Gibson  
Mark Hayden  
Thomas Lampert  
John LeBlanc  
*Managing Editors*

Kurtis Brown  
Julia Eaton  
Alexander Pringle  
*Executive Comments Editors*

*Senior Editors*

Nicholas Anastasi  
Wendy Beylik  
Erin Bruno  
Nicholas Centrella  
Amanda Creedon  
Brian Durkin  
Lindsey Edinger  
Meghan Fay  
Thomas Fiascone  
Tanner Fiske  
Alyssa Fixsen

Patrick Ford  
Vaishali Goyal  
Lauren Hadjaris  
Theodore Kaminski  
Bryan Kim  
Jamie Kurtz  
Heekyoung Lee  
Molly McGrath  
David Miller  
Jennifer Moore

Marc Palmer  
Angelica Rankins  
Lauren Sposa  
Aaron Staudinger  
Erika Steinbauer  
Shivani Suhag  
Adanna Uwazurike

Shannon Nelson  
Meghan L. Paresky  
Mitchell Perne  
Eric Popp  
Mary Kate Sexton  
Leila Souhail  
Anna Snook  
Anna Stuart  
Benjamin Taylor  
Kelly Waldo  
Sommer Wiss



# BOSTON COLLEGE LAW REVIEW

---

Volume 59

January 2018

Number 1

---

## *Staff Writers*

Lauren Allen  
Timothy Andrea  
Samuel Ascanio  
Alexis Berglund  
Samantha Bhate  
Emma Bolla  
Alexandre Bou-Rhodes  
Molly Boyd  
Virginia Calistro  
Michael Casagrande  
Mitchell Clough  
Jesse Coulon  
Curtis Cranston  
Christopher Crocker  
Peter Diliberti  
Alex Dilley  
Natasha Dobrott  
Samuel Dougherty  
Hannah Dudley  
Hannah Esquenazi  
Brandon Ferrick

Mariah Figlietti Vasquez  
Abigail Garrahan  
John Gavin  
Amy-Lee Goodman  
Rebecca Hayes  
Leah Hengemuhle  
Roman Ibragimov  
Jennifer Jacobs  
Elizabeth Johnson  
Stephanie Johnson  
Margaux Joselow  
Srish Khakurel  
Meghan King  
Michael Koch  
Garabed Koosherian  
Brooke Kootman  
Lauren Koster  
Katherine Lee  
Kathryn Maass  
Connor Macisaac  
Hunter Malasky  
Hale McAnulty

Morgan McDonald  
Sean Patrick McGinley  
Kayleigh McGlynn  
Thomas McLaughlin  
Christian Milde  
Tyler Mills  
Christina Min  
Marcus Nemeth  
Joseph Noreña  
Terence Olsen  
Jeremy Pepper  
Vasundhara Prasad  
Jazmyn Reid  
Claudia Restrepo  
Madeline Roe  
Jason Sitomer  
Lauren Stewart  
Emily Tate  
Bryan Thompson  
Julian Viksman  
Kathryn Weston

---

Daniel Lyons  
*Faculty Advisor*

Nick Szydłowski  
*Webmaster*

Patricia McCoy  
*Faculty Advisor*

John Gordon  
*Director, Law Review Publications*

David Olson  
*Faculty Advisor*

Joan Shear  
*Library Liaison*

Unless otherwise expressly provided, the author or authors of each article in this volume granted permission for copies of that article to be made and used by educational and other nonprofit institutions, so long as (1) copies are distributed at or below cost; (2) the authorship and journal are identified therein; and (3) proper notice of copyright is set forth. Send any other reprint permission requests to [permissions-gggroup@bc.edu](mailto:permissions-gggroup@bc.edu).

Copyright © 2018 by Boston College Law School  
This REVIEW is to be cited as B.C. L. REV. E. SUPP.

